

Ladies Shiur Course on the Laws of Shabbat - Part 2
Dedicated in loving memory of: יהודה עמרם בן אלי הכהן ז"ל

🌀 Another Brief Introduction

We explained last week – to get even the minimum grasp of Bishul on Shabbat will require more than 2 hours of study. It is hoped that the course notes and shiurim will facilitate clarity in this area. Remember, no pain no gain! Learning something new will always take effort – and don't be surprised if upon first hearing the concepts they go way above your head. This is normal!

🌀 Direct Heat

As we have studied already, BISHUL is causing a change via heat. Direct Heat or *שא* – is the simplest form. An example would be: putting meat on the flame or in an oven to cook. This is *BISHUL B'AISH* – meaning food cooked with direct heat.

Any form of DIRECT HEATING is the *TORAH PROHIBITION OF BISHUL*.

Based on what we learnt last week, this would mean:

SOLID FOODS: The prohibition is transgressed when the food hits MACHAL BEN DEROSAI.

LIQUIDS: When it hits the temperature of YAD SOLEDET - 43°C.

🌀 Secondary HEAT

A hot material that absorbed heat from a flame can also cause bishul. Known in halacha as TOLDAT AISH. When hot enough, TOLDAT AISH can even cause the Torah prohibition of BISHUL.

שו"ע אורח חיים סימן שיח
ג) כשם שאסור לבשל באור כך אסור לבשל בתולדת האור כגון ליתן ביצה בצד קדרה או
לשברה על סודר שהוחם באור כדי שתצלה

תלמוד בבלי מסכת שבת דף מא/א
המיחם שפינהו לא יתן לתוכו צונן בשביל שיחמו

The Gemara explains this to mean that one who empties out a pot of hot water – is not allowed to pour in cold water to heat it up – EVEN IF IT IS NO LONGER ON THE FIRE!

🌀 Let's get practical with Secondary HEAT (Toldat Aish)

This concept has a major impact in the laws of Bishul. In fact, MOST PRACTICAL PROBLEMS ON SHABBAT relating to Bishul – involve the use of SECONDARY HEAT!! Very hot foods or drinks are often categorised as secondary heat.

🌀 Examples...

- If one would pour hot water from an urn onto a tea bag or even a piece of lemon – this is BISHUL through Toldat Aish.
(Even if one would argue that you could eat the lemon raw and therefore its not considered cooking – there is a concern that it improves via cooking and therefore is BISHUL:

שער הציון סימן שיח
קיד) הנה ברמב"ם פ"ט ה"ג כתב דהמבשל דבר שמבושל כ"צ או שא"צ בישול כלל פטור
ופשוט לענ"ד דהיינו דבר שאינו משתבח כלל ע"י הבישול ולאפוקי פירות וכה"ג שהוא
משתבח ע"י הבישול

- To sprinkle seasoning, pepper, or other spices – except salt into hot soup!

שו"ע אורח חיים סימן שיח
ט) כלי ראשון (פי' הכלי שמשמש בו על האש) אפילו לאחר שהעבירו מעל האש מבשל
כל זמן שהיד סולדת בו לפיכך אסור ליתן לתוכו תבלין אבל מלח מותר ליתן לתוכו כיון
שהעבירו מעל האש דצריכא מלחא בישולא כבשרא דתורא

🌀 The various categories of Secondary Heat

We need to get familiar with some basic terminology which we will constantly be referring to.

Keli Rishon (First Vessel); Keli Sheni; Keli Shelishi
Erui Keli Rishon (Pouring from a first vessel); Erui Keli Sheni
Davar Gush (Solid)

↻ Introduction to KELIM

KELI RISHON: Let's define this as the container in which a food or liquid was cooked or heated – via a direct source of heat. There are 2 types.

1. KELI RISHON - Al Haish: This refers to a container on the fire or other source of heat. It is the STRICTEST of all the categories we just mentioned and can cause BISHUL of virtually anything that comes into contact with it.

↻ Examples

- A pot of soup which is boiling on the blech.
- An Urn of hot water that is boiling.
- Chulent on the blech.
- Crock Pot with food in it.

In any of the above examples – it is FORBIDDEN to put any uncooked food/liquid into these containers – even if they have not yet reached boiling point.

And so.... To sprinkle seasoning, dice onions into such a pot – is BISHUL!!

2. KELI RISHON - Shehutar Min Ha'aish: Refers to a KELI RISHON that was removed from the flame/blech/hotplate/oven – and is thus no longer heated by an active source.

- A pot of soup removed from the blech.
- Pot of Chulent removed from the blech.
- The ceramic pot removed from the Crock Pot heating element.

This type is not as powerful as Keli Rishon on the fire because it lacks the same heat intensity. However, there are a few exceptional foods that are not susceptible to BISHUL in a Keli Rishon – in most cases any KELI RISHON whether on or off the fire CAN CAUSE BISHUL.

Practically: One is NOT ALLOWED TO put into a Keli Rishon almost every type of uncooked food or liquid – whilst the Keli Rishon is still hot/yad soledet bo.

↻ Erui Keli Rishon- pouring from a first vessel

This refers to the stream of hot liquid as it pours out from a Keli Rishon.

The difference between Erui Keli Rishon & Keli Rishon: When liquid is in the original container it retains heat due to the insulating effect of the Keli. Once it is poured the liquid stream loses heat before reaching the interior of the next Keli – which it is poured into.

And so, ERUI KELI RISHON is weaker than Keli Rishon for the purposes of Bishul. But it is more powerful than KELI SHENI.

שו"ע אורח חיים סימן שיח
(י: אסור ליתן תבלין בקערה ולערות עליהן מכלי ראשון)

משנה ברורה סימן שיח
עד) מכלי ראשון - דאף דתבלין אין מתבשל בכ"ש וכנ"ל מ"מ העירוי מכ"ר קי"ל דהוא מבשל
כדי קליפה (קא) ואפי' בדיעבד אסור אם עירה להדיא עליהן (קב) שלא נפסק הקילוח

Erui Keli Rishon onto Solids and Liquids - Differences

Solids: The Shulchan Aruch implies that “Erui” cannot penetrate to the full depth of the solid and cook it. But it can cause the Torah prohibition of BISHUL on the outer surface ... this is known as “Bishul Kedai Klipah” – cooking the outer layer.

Practically: One CANNOT pour water from the urn into a glass containing a slice of lemon. One is not allowed to pour hot gravy from a pan onto fresh vegetables!!

Liquids: A cold liquid does not become cooked to any degree with Erui simply on contact.

שו"ע אורח חיים סימן שיח
ומותר לצוק מים חמין לתוך מים צונן

Only if the cold liquid becomes hot and hits Yad Soledet Bo – then Bishul occurs. So one could not pour a large volume of hot water from a urn into a small amount of cold liquid – as this would be BISHUL.

Practically: One CANNOT pour a large amount of hot water from the urn into a glass containing a small amount of cold water.

☞ The simple difference and being practical with a Baby Bottle

Erui is ONLY MEVASHEL KEDEI K'LIPAH on solids because they have a stable surface. The Erui will then cause BISHUL in that area. A liquid has no stable surface and therefore no part of the liquid ever has a chance to be "cooked" via Erui as the liquid will be instantly absorbed and mixed in with the other liquid.

Therefore.....

- If one has cold milk in a bottle – one is allowed to pour DIRECTLY from the urn into the bottle to remove the chill – as long as the milk doesn't get hot.
- So too, in the winter when you wash your hands with cold water for Netilat Yadayim, one is allowed to pour DIRECTLY from the urn into the cup to remove the chill – as long as the water doesn't get hot.

☞ KELI SHENI - Second Vessel

This is a lower degree of heat than Keli Rishon.

תלמוד בבלי מסכת שבת דף מ/ב
ושמע מינה כלי שני אינו מבשל

משנה ברורה סימן שיח
פז) בכלי שני - כ"ש מיקרי כשעירו מן כלי ראשון שהרתיחו החמין בתוכו לתוך כלי זה ומותר
אפי' אם היד סולדת בו

Golden Rule: Keli Sheni is not capable of cooking most foods even when tis Yad Soledet Bo!

☞ Examples

- A cup of hot water filled up directly from the urn.
- A bowl of soup filled directly from the pot.

☞ Kalei Habishul

Some foods are very sensitive to heat and can be susceptible to BISHUL even in a KELI SHENI. For example, the Mishna lists old fish such as herring, Spanish mackerel. So these foods one could not put into a Keli Sheni or even pour from a Keli Sheni onto them.

The Shulchan Aruch explains that these foods can be made edible with a low degree of heat. So the Spanish Fish can be made edible by pouring water from a Keli Sheni onto it – and therefore this constitutes “cooking it”!!

☞ A Brief word about the KAF - ladle

A Kaf is any container that is immersed into a Keli Rishon to remove its contents.

The problem exists that it could be compared to a Keli Sheni because it is not in the original container --- but a ladle goes INTO THE KELI SHENI and absorbs a lot of the heat. And therefore it could be argued that it is NOT like a Keli Sheni!

Various opinions about its status .. one can generally be lenient.

משנה ברורה סימן שיח

כן מה שנוהגין איזה אנשים כשעושין חמין מרגלי בהמה לחתוך חתיכת פת בכלי ולערות עליהם המרק של הרגלים מכ"ר (עא) לא יפה הם עושין דאפילו אם לא יתן הפת בתחלה עד שיערה המרק תחלה בכלי כדי שיעשה כ"ש הלא כתב רמ"א דיש ליזהר בזה אלא אם רוצה ליתן פת ימתין עד שלא יהיה היד סולדת במרק או שלכל הפחות ישאב בכף מן הקדרה כדי שתהיה הקערה כלי שלישי

☞ Keli Shelishi

A container into which hot food or liquid from a Keli Sheni was poured.

☞ A leniency worth remembering....

שו"ת אגרות משה אורח חיים ח"ד סימן עד

(טו) האם מותר להכין טיי בכלי שלישי בשבת.

תשובה: לע"ד לא נראה כלל לומר דאיכא דברים שמתבשלים בכלי שלישי. דלא מצינו אלא שבכלי שני יש דברים המתבשלין וממילא מאחר שאין אנו יודעין יש לאסור כל דבר, ובכלי שלישי לא מצינו,..... וא"כ אין לנו לומר מעצמנו כלום אלא מקבלה וממילא הוא ככל סתם דברים דהוא בכלי שני ספק ובכלי שלישי יש להתיר

So Rav Moshe Feinstein rules that a Keli Shelishi CANNOT CAUSE BISHUL in anything – no matter how hot it is!!

Based upon this decision – one can avoid most halachick problems relating to Bishul bu using a Kli Shelishi whenever preparing hot foods or drinks.

☞ Davar Gush (hard solid)

This refers to anything which is fairly solid and is hot. We will see that a hot solid food can retain the status of a Keli Rishon even after its transferred to a Keli Sheni or Keli Shelishi.

The Maharashal puts forth the argument that a Keli Sheni is only when the foods mix – but a piece of meat or fish – that is removed piping out from the pan – if it's YAD SOLEDET BO – it retains its original status of keli Rishon!

☞ Practically Speaking....

A hot potato remain hot inside even if it's cold on the outside. So it can retain its heat to the degree of a Keli Rishon – even after being removed from the pot. So too with a piece of Chicken or Meat.

Since the food is so dense – it retains heat for a long time. Furthermore it does not cool down by the colder surface of the keli Sheni – because it does not come in complete contact with the Keli Sheni - like a liquid.

☞ General Laws of Davar Gush....

The custom is to be strict and treat a Davar Gush with the restrictions of a Keli Rishon. So one would not be allowed to sprinkle onions, garlic – or any uncooked spices onto a Davar Gush – just like we learnt you can't do this into a Keli Rishon!

☞ What do we do with our Heinz™ Ketchup???

שו"ת אגרות משה אורח חיים ח"ד סימן עד

(ה) האם מותר ליתן קעטשאפ בשבת על בשר רותח הנמצא בכלי שני, די ש כאן ב' חומרות א' לחוש לדעת מהרש"ל שדבר גוש חם חשב כלי ראשון. ב' לחוש שיש בישול אחר בישול בדבר לח (עי' רמ"א /או"ח/ סי' שי"ח סעי' ט"ו).

ועוד אולי הקעטשאפ לא חשיב משקה כיון שהוא עב ביותר.

תשובה: נראה לדינא כדעת כתר"ה דרשאין ליתן קעטשאפ על בשר רותח שניתן לכלי

שני דאף אם נחמיר גם שתי חומרות הוא בשתי חומרות שהוא ספק ממש כל חומרא שאף שהוא ס"ס =ספק ספיקא= אולי יש להחמיר בשבת משום חומרתו. אבל הכא חומרא די ש

בשול אחר בשול בדבר לח הוא חומרא בעלמא שגדולי הפוסקים סברי דגם בלח אין בשול אחר בשול וכן הוא הכרעת הרמ"א ונוהגין כן דרך שבנצטן לגמרי מחמיר. וגם החומרא בדבר גוש שאף בכלי שני הוא עדיין כרותח, הא פליגי הרבה על זה ובתוכם הרמ"א (יו"ד צ"ב ס"ז) אשר הוא עיקר גדול בהוראה, לכן צדק כתר"ה דאין להחמיר שתי החומרות אלו אף באיסורי שבת.

Two factors are at play here. 1. the ketchup was once cooked; 2. the meat is a Daavr Gush and not a true Keli Rishon.

↻ One final Gush point!

This law of Davar Gush only applies when the solid is not in liquid. If it is in liquid it assumes the status of the liquid into which it is immersed. So if the MEAT is in a Kli Sheni filled with liquid – it becomes a Kli Sheni!

So if a bowl of meatballs with sauce – is poured from the pan into a bowl – the whole dish is a Kli Sheni!!

↻ Still to cover....

Based on much of the above, we still need to cover:

- Concepts of reheating foods and liquids.
- The Rabbinical Restrictions of Bishul --- *sheiya* (leaving food on the flame); *chazara* (returning food to the flame); *hatmana* (insulating food).
- *Common Bishul Applications – hot water, washing dishes with urn water, the blech, hotplate, oven, urn, crockpot, preparation of hot drinks on Shabbat*